

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF JULY 23, 2009
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:05 PM

| | | |
|--------------------|---------------------|---------------|
| Chairperson | John Lemmo | Present |
| Vice Chairperson | Jerry Schaefer | Present |
| Boardmember | Salvador Aréchiga | Present |
| Boardmember | Priscilla Berge | Present |
| Boardmember | Alex Bethke | Present |
| <i>Boardmember</i> | <i>Maria Curry</i> | <i>Absent</i> |
| <i>Boardmember</i> | <i>Gail Garbini</i> | <i>Absent</i> |
| Boardmember | Linda Marrone | Present |
| <i>Boardmember</i> | <i>Abel Silvas</i> | <i>Absent</i> |

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Cathy Winterrowd, Principal Planner
Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner
Jennifer Hirsch, Senior Planner
Tricia Olsen, Associate Planner
Andrew Goodrich, Planning Intern
Joseph Fantone, Planning Intern

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Nina Fain, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES for May 21, 2009 and June 25, 2009

Minutes from May 21, 2009 and June 25, 2009 were not available for approval.

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

- **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Curry was out of town; Boardmember Garbini was attending to family health issues; and Boardmember Silvas is recovering from a fall and serious injuries.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Business Cards (for the Boardmembers who have not already received them)
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation
- ✓ Three emails related to item 8; including a request for a continuance
- ✓ A letter related to item 7

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

Chair Lemmo, Vice-Chair Schaefer, Boardmembers Aréchiga, Bethke, Marrone, and Berge; all had ex parte communications during their site visits (*interior/exterior*).

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS /PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

Chair Lemmo and Boardmember Bethke were unable to see the interiors of Item 10 – Casa De La Torre; owners were not home during the scheduled interior visit.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO INVOKE WAIVER FOR THE BOARDMEMBERS WHO WERE UNABLE TO VIEW THE INTERIORS FOR ITEM 10 – CASA DE LA TORRE AND ITEM 13 – RICHARD M. HATHAWAY SPEC. HOUSE NO. 2; PHOTOS INCLUDED IN THE REPORT ARE SUFFICIENT.

Seconded by Vice-Chair Schaefer

VOTE: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR SCHAEFER TO INVOKE WAIVER FOR THE SITE VISITS FOR ARCHAEOLOGY SITES; ITEM 5 – ARCHAEOLOGY SITE CA-SDI-11,039 AND ITEM 15 – VILLAGE OF YSTAGUA, AREA #1; THERE IS ENOUGH INFORMATION IN THE REPORTS PROVIDED TO THE BOARD.

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

VOTE: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

C. STAFF REPORT

- Interns: Andrew Goodrich; BA from UCSD in Urban Studies and Planning; and Joseph Fantone; MA in Historic Preservation and Urban Planning at the University of Pennsylvania.
- Earlier this month, the City Council established the Historic Preservation Fund as recommended in the General Plan and as a companion item to adopting the General Plan Action Plan. The Historic Preservation Fund was established for the purpose of local historic preservation incentives such as an architectural assistance program, archaeological site protection plan, or other furtherance of historic preservation consistent with the General Plan. Staff will be putting together a programmatic approach for the expenditure of these funds and will present it to the Incentives Subcommittee and then take to City Council for approval. We will keep the Board informed about any funding sources and potential expenditures.
- Staff is organizing a one day seminar in Best Practices in Historic Preservation as part of the City's required annual CLG training. The topics will include an in depth look at historic contexts and surveys, a session on Historical Resources and CEQA, and a detailed review of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards with a presentation of real world examples. We are organizing the speakers at this time and anticipate a number of experts in the field to participate. The seminar will be required for Board Members and Staff and will be open to other local government preservation commissions and staff, consultants, preservation and community interest groups, the general public and students. The seminar will take place on Monday, September 14, 2009 in Balboa Park. Flyers with more information will be distributed within the next week or so. We are hoping for a large turnout for this exciting event.
- The next DAS meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, August 4. The next Incentives Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, August 10. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, August 10. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting is scheduled for Monday, September 14.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes 4 referrals from Development Services including 1 continued from March's hearing, 6 individual homeowner nominations and 1 recision. There are 20 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2007, 52 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008, and 9 homeowner nominations in 2009 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

The owner of Item 8 – 2909 Chatsworth Blvd. is requesting a 30-day continuance

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO GRANT A 30-DAY CONTINUENCE FOR ITEM 8 – 2909 CHATSWORTH BLVD. AT THE REQUEST OF THE OWNER

Seconded by Vice-Chair Schaefer

VOTE: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

- ITEM 5 – ARCHAEOLOGY SITE CA-SDI-11,039
- ITEM 9 – JOHN AND CLEO ZWECK HOUSE *located at 3305 Yonge Street*
- ITEM 10 – CASA DE LA TORRE *located at 4145 Miller Street*
- ITEM 11 – GEORGE GANS SPEC HOUSE #3 *located at 3120 Felton Street*
- ITEM 12 – LAURENCE KLAUBER HOUSE *located at 233 West Juniper Street*
- ITEM 13 – RICHARD M. HATHAWAY SPEC. HOUSE NO. 2 *located at 1855 Altamira Place*
- ITEM 15 – VILLAGE OF YSTAGUA, AREA #1

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION ON CONSENT AGENDA WITH MODIFICATIONS TO THE FOLLOWING ITEMS: ITEM 10 – CASA DE LA TORRE, NAME CHANGED TO THE GEORGE AND BEATRICE BOWN HOUSE AND TO INCLUDE THE INTERIORS (LIVING ROOM, ENTRYWAY AND TOWER ROOM) IN THE RESOLUTION; ITEM 11 – GEORGE GANS SPEC HOUSE #3, CHANGE WORDING IN THE RESOLUTION WITH REGARDS TO THE SIGNATURE FRONT PORCH CURVED WALL; AND ITEM 13 – RICHARD M. HATHAWAY SPEC. HOUSE NO. 2, CHANGE FAMILY ROOM TO STUDY ROOM IN THE RESOLUTION AND INCLUDE THE OUTSIDE STEPS, HARDSCAPE AND YUCCA PLANTS IN THE DESIGNATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke

VOTE: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – ARCHAEOLOGY SITE CA-SDI-11,039

Continued from March 2009

Applicant: Del Mar Heritage, represented by Affinis

Location: Not Permitted to List, Black Mountain Ranch, Council District 1

Description: Consider the designation of the property above as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate Archaeology Site CA-SDI-11,039 as a historical resource under HRB Criterion A

Report Number: HRB-09-039

ITEM PASSENT ON CONSENT

ITEM 6 – STEPHEN MCMORROW SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: James & Lillian Thompson Family Living Trust represented by Scott Moomjian

Location: 3620 Albert Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 **(1269 6-B)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3620 Albert Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Stephen McMorow Spec House #1 located at 3620 Albert Street, excluding all other structures on the parcel, as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-09-051

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Barry Hager

In Opposition: Steve Shannon

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Aréchiga is in support of Staff's recommendation

Chair Lemmo was anticipating more information from the applicant, based on what he has heard he is also in support of Staff's recommendation

Vice-Chair Schaefer wanted to point out that there is an error in the consultant's report; it identifies the property as being in the University Heights neighborhood when it is actually in the Hillcrest neighborhood. Error is noted, and does not affect the features of the property, address is correct. Property is not a high style Craftsman, but has all of the elements of style and integrity needed. He also supports Staff's recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER ARÉCHIGA TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – STEPHEN MCMORROW SPEC HOUSE #1 PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Vice-Chair Schaefer

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 7 – MABEL B. SCHILLER/RICHARD REQUA HOUSE

Applicant: Jeffrey Gunn & Megan Marcotte represented by Scott Moomjian

Location: 2207 29th Street, 92104, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3 (**1289 1-E**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2207 29th Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Mabel B. Schiller/Richard Requa House located at 2207 29th Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1939 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-09-045

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Jeff Gunn

Board Discussion:

Vice-Chair Schaefer agrees that the house should be designated; it is one of the last Requa house and a divergence from his style. He is pleased that the owners are not opposed to the designation and is sympathetic to the bars; they are a huge safety issue, as well as a character defining feature of the home. He would suggest that under these circumstances allow the bars be removed with record of original element submitted to South Coastal Information Center and San Diego Historical Society.

Boardmember Berge also agrees that the bars are character defining features

Boardmember Bethke agrees with Vice-Chair Schaefer, by only removing the side bars and leaving the rear bars in place will illustrate what was there.

Boardmember Aréchiga agrees with Boardmember Bethke, but would like to know what will happen to the bars once they are removed

Staff recommends the designation include the bars; then refer to DAS to address removal of the bars

Vice-Chair Schaefer wants bars excluded from the designation; doesn't want to see a situation where we the designation is rescinded if the bars come off.

Chair Lemmo doesn't want to see a situation where we designate and it goes before DAS and there isn't a feasible way to keep bars or similar looking bars on that window.

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – MABEL B. SCHILLER/
RICHARD REQUA HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION EXCLUDING THE
BARS ON THE SOUTH ELEVATION WINDOW**

Seconded by Vice-Chair Schaefer

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 8 – 2909 CHATSWORTH BLVD.

Applicant: Raquel & Kevin Greene represented by Scott Moomjian

Location: 2909 Chatsworth Blvd., 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-D**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2909 Chatsworth Blvd. as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the house at 2909 Chatsworth Blvd. as a historical resource under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB-09-017

ITEM CONTINUED FOR 30-DAYS AT THE OWNERS REQUEST

ITEM 9 – JOHN AND CLEO ZWECK HOUSE

Applicant: Mary & Robert Bates represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 3305 Yonge Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1268 7-C**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3305 Yonge Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the John and Cleo Zweck House located at 3305 Yonge Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1948 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-09-046

ITEM PASSENT ON CONSENT

ITEM 10 – CASA DE LA TORRE

Applicant: Dittamore Family Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4145 Miller Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4145 Miller Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Casa de la Torre located at 4145 Miller Street as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-09-047

ITEM PASSENT ON CONSENT

ITEM 11 – GEORGE GANS SPEC HOUSE #3

Applicant: Rebecca Grossenbacher Trust represented by Scott Moomjian

Location: 3120 Felton Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 7-F**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3120 Felton Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the George Gans Spec House #3 as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C for Craftsman architecture and HRB Criterion D for master builder George Gans.

Report Number: HRB-09-048

ITEM PASSENT ON CONSENT

ITEM 12 – LAURENCE KLAUBER HOUSE

Applicant: Graham Downes Trouncer Living Trust represented by Johnson & Johnson Architecture.

Location: 233 West Juniper Street, 92101, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1289 1-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 233 West Juniper Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Laurence Klauber House located at 233 West Juniper Street under HRB Criterion B for its association with Laurence Klauber, a historically significant individual.

Report Number: HRB-09-049

ITEM PASSENT ON CONSENT

ITEM 13 – RICHARD M. HATHAWAY SPEC. HOUSE NO. 2

Applicant: Fred & Mary Buchanan Family Disclaimer Trust et al represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 1855 Altamira Place, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1855 Altamira Place as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Richard M. Hathaway Spec. House No. 2 at 1855 Altamira Place as a historical resource under HRB Criteria C.

Report Number: HRB-09-050

ITEM PASSENT ON CONSENT

ITEM 14 – 155 19th STREET, SHERMAN HEIGHTS DISTRICT CONTRIBUTOR

Applicant: Leticia Garcia represented by Philip Shapiro

Location: 155 19th Street, 92102, Southeastern San Diego Community, Council District 8 (**1289 4-C**)

Description: Consider the rescision of the designation of the Sherman Heights District Contributor located at 155 19th Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Rescind the designation of 155 19th Street; or do not rescind.

Staff Recommendation: Rescind the designation of the property at 155 19th Street, designated as HRB Site #208-003, due to a loss of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-09-037

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Louise Torio (*Steve Veach*)

In Opposition: Philip Shapiro, Roger Robledos

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge thinks this is an extremely difficult case; asked Staff if the Board has ever rescinded designation before.

Staff response, not that we can determine

Boardmember Berge agrees that there has been a change in circumstances, but the owner did get permits; Mills Act hopeful solution, sees no valid reason(s) to rescind.

Boardmember Bethke agrees with the first speaker, this situation has unforeseen precedence written all over it. The house is not a representation of a historic structure; it is no longer a contributor to the district. House does not conform to the DPR photo. He supports rescinded the designation.

Vice-Chair Schaefer questioned non-historic finish on wood; very difficult to reverse mistakes made in reconstruction. He supports staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Bethke issue was not with what was presented, but with what was completed.

Boardmember Marrone thinks there are two issues here: the most obvious is the photos; they show the deviation between the original house and the new house, and then there is the issue, is it the Board's authority to review plans etc. or just to look at current situation.

Chair Lemmo advised the Board to look at extent of the new information and its merit and the weight of it compared to the information they already have as it relates to the original designation. As he has already stated he is troubled by the whole thing and doesn't like how it turns on either side of the coin; but is strongly leaning towards not supporting the staff's recommendation in what he views as extraordinary circumstances.

Boardmember Aréchiga is bothered that the owner was not given the correct information by Staff; would like to continue item until the next month, he is not ready to vote.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER ARÉCHIGA TO CONTINUE ITEM 14 – 155 19th STREET UNTIL THE AUGUST HEARING AND HAVE PLANS TO REVIEW.

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 5-1-0
(Bethke)

Motion Passes

ITEM 15 – VILLAGE OF YSTAGUA, AREA #1

Applicant: CLL Roselle LLC represented by RBF Consulting

Location: Not Permitted to List, Torrey Pines Community, Council District 1

Description: Consider the designation of the property above as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Village of Ystagua, Area #1 as a historical resource under HRB Criterion A

Report Number: HRB-09-052

ITEM PASSENT ON CONSENT

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Thursday, August 27, 2009

LOCATION: City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:20 PM